



Title	Research on critical literacy in foreign language teaching
Author(s)	Silva, Cecilia Noemi
Citation	大阪大学, 2003, 博士論文
Version Type	
URL	<a href="https://hdl.handle.net/11094/44165">https://hdl.handle.net/11094/44165</a>
rights	
Note	著者からインターネット公開の許諾が得られていないため、論文の要旨のみを公開しています。全文のご利用をご希望の場合は、 <a href="https://www.library.osaka-u.ac.jp/thesis/#closed">〈a href="https://www.library.osaka-u.ac.jp/thesis/#closed"〉</a> 大阪大学の博士論文について <a href="https://www.library.osaka-u.ac.jp/thesis/#closed">〈/a〉</a> をご参照ください。

*The University of Osaka Institutional Knowledge Archive : OUKA*

<https://ir.library.osaka-u.ac.jp/>

The University of Osaka

氏名	シルバ セシリア ノエミ SILVA CECILIA NOEMI
博士の専攻分野の名称	博士 (人間科学)
学位記番号	第 17479 号
学位授与年月日	平成 15 年 3 月 25 日
学位授与の要件	学位規則第 4 条第 1 項該当 人間科学研究科人間科学専攻
学位論文名	Research on critical literacy in foreign language teaching (外国語教育におけるクリティカル・リテラシーに関する研究)
論文審査委員	(主査) 教授 菅井 勝雄  (副査) 教授 前迫 孝憲 教授 平沢 安政

#### 論文内容の要旨

According to Freire and Macedo (1987, quoted in Kern 2000) "The command of reading and writing is achieved beginning with words and themes meaningful to the common experience of those becoming literate, and not with words and themes linked only to the experience of the educator". If we consider Freire's theory in the sense that literacy implies the relationship between learners and the world, it is possible to explain the implication of literacy in foreign language teaching : words and utterances are not superimposed to students as something external but students naturally construct and internalize them. Critical literacy is not commonly related to the field of foreign language learning : it is normally associated with classes of literacy instruction conducted in the national language (Freire 1970, Ellworth et al 1994) and there are also works carried out in English as a Foreign Language (Wallace, in Fairclough 1992, and Lankshear 1997) and in French (Kern 2000). Nevertheless, the issue of critical literacy in Spanish as a Foreign Language has not yet become a subject of much research. The present study contains two approaches, discourse analysis and meaning design, and reports about the application of elements of critical literacy (powerful concepts, generative words, local, personal and cultural forces, meaning design, word meaning, intertextuality and reconstruction of metaphors) in classes of Spanish as a foreign language so as to lead students into enlarging vocabulary and using actively the target language as a tool for thinking and communication. Data were taken since 1999 to 2002 out of classroom work accomplished by 290 Japanese university students.

The present thesis is organized in three parts.

- I. The first part contains the definitions of literacy and critical literacy to which the present study adheres (Chapter 1) and a classroom experience with advanced students (Chapter 2).
- II. The second part, classroom work with first year students, is divided into IIa : activities whose point of departure are words (Chapter 3), sentences (Chapter 4) and texts (Chapter 5) generated by students, and IIb : activities whose point of departure are texts analyzed by students (Chapters 6 and 7).
- III. The third part contains the main conclusions regarding the original purpose of the study, the approaches, and

the conducted classroom activities (Chapter 8).

#### **Chapter 1. The concept of literacy and critical literacy**

This chapter reports about the main concepts of literacy and critical literacy considered in the present thesis : (1) acquiring critical literacy implies a process of constructing meaning and critically using language as a means of expression and interpretation, (2) the application of critical elements in foreign language teaching implies that words and utterances are not superimposed to students but constructed by them. In addition, this chapter contains a detailed explanation of the Method of Critical Framing (Theory, Situated Practice, Overt Instruction and Transformed Practice) followed for the sake of designing activities and defining their theoretical frame.

#### **Chapter 2. Critical literacy and work with powerful concepts**

This chapter aims at reporting a classroom experience along which 82 students in a class of Argentine History deconstructed and reconstructed knowledge out of printed and visual material. This chapter explains how theories of knowledge acquisition and social constructionism were applied in the classes, and there is also a detailed reference to classroom work with powerful concepts using the Interpretation Construction Design Model, the Method of Social Inquiry and strategies taken from the field of Media Literacy. Results : students produced 32 powerful concepts.

#### **Chapter 3. Critical literacy and generative words**

This chapter aims at developing an approach to critical literacy departing from generative words towards the construction of dialogue. The basic idea is the intention to guide students into a more independent construction of the language. 61 students participated in the experience along which Paulo Freire's problem-posing approach was used in order to create a rich learning environment wherein students could interact through listening, dialogue and action/production. Results : problem-posing approach led students into exploring themes related to personal, social and institutional spheres, investigating new words, and constructing dialogue.

#### **Chapter 4. Critical literacy in communities of practice**

This chapter refers to classroom activities visualized through the model of collective activity, with three different mediations (textbook, letters, online communication) and makes especial reference to the concepts : mediation, collective/dialogic activity, communities of practice and discourse and construction of meaning. Results : changes in classroom work were associated with students' activities (active builders of utterances), teacher's role (support), content (authentic material), and language (cultural awareness pervades the whole class).

#### **Chapter 5. Critical literacy and meaning design : construction of texts**

This chapter reports about classroom activities aiming at students' meaning design. A guide was built out of the combination of components of Project READ for critical literacy guidance (Calfee 1994) and linguistic and schematic resources (Kern 2000). 68 students chose a film or a book and wrote about it following such guide. Along oral work in class students were asked to talk about the resources they had used when building the texts. Results : students became aware of the resources and the language subtleties they used when constructed meaning in their reports.

#### **Chapter 6. Critical literacy and meaning redesign : reconstruction of a gender issue out of a film**

This chapter comments about classroom activities along which the components of Project READ were used

aiming at meaning redesign. 35 students took part of the activities : supported by a written activity and a conceptual mapping, they reconstructed the female image out of a film by means of very simple dialogues. Results : classroom dialogue containing interesting ideas about gender issues.

#### **Chapter 7. Critical reading of poetry analyzed from the perspective of the ZPD**

It is herein described how the analysis of three poems guided students into enlarging vocabulary and realizing that surface meaning of words is not enough. Classroom activities developed following Fairclough's model : description, interpretation, and explanation, seen through the lens of the Zone of Proximal Development aimed at guiding students in the road from what is "directly inscribed" in the text towards what is "indirectly evoked". Results : students understood that the dictionary is not enough, the context is relevant, there is relation between a poem and reality, and there are several possible answers.

#### **Chapter 8. Conclusions related to purposes, approaches, and classroom activities**

The study of application of critical literacy elements in foreign language teaching highlights three points. First, regarding the original purposes of the study, using elements of critical literacy can provide a mechanism for enlarging vocabulary and using the language actively as a tool for thinking and communication because the learning that takes place is not limited to repetition of words or utterances, or to an isolated theme but it allows multiple connections with other aspects. Second, regarding the approaches, meaning design and discourse analysis serves the purpose of leading students beyond acquiring and repeating new words : students produce new words and concepts (powerful concepts), construct new utterances by themselves, become aware of language subtleties, and understand the relevance of context. Third, as regards classroom activities, from the accomplished work it is possible to indicate several aspects. As first year students should also acquire simple structures and word usage, it is advisable to combine this kind of activities with textbooks. Questions directed to students should be done one by one because they need to understand all the words. Students are not aware of models so, no matter how simple models could be, they should be transformed into simple guides and questions so as to prevent learners from feeling overburdened with difficult words related to working methods. Most of the students declares that the activities were interesting but difficult : students worked within a still reduced frame of vocabulary and grammar and, as they were required to go beyond mere repetition of new words, this kind of activity might not be easily accomplished by first year students. Therefore, attaining the optimum balance between the level of difficulty of activities and the level of students' skills in the target language is suggested for further research on critical literacy and foreign language teaching.

### **論文審査の結果の要旨**

本論文は、外国語大学でスペイン語教育を担当する中で、外国語教育における現代的課題を追及しながら新たな学習指導法の開発をめざして、教育実験的になされた一連の研究から構成されている。そして、6つの指導モデルが提示されている。

基本的には、従来の教師主導による単語や文法や発話の繰り返しの学習に代わって、学習者中心の指導法への転換を図るという立場がとられている。

そこで、本論文の全編にわたって、学習者自らが能動的に学習し、批判的な観点も含ませながら対話などにより語彙を広げたり、強力な概念を身につけたり、意味の構成などを行うと同時に、それを社会や文化にまで広げるという、クリティカル・リテラシーのアプローチが採用される。それに加えて、思考やコミュニケーションの道具としての言語観のもとに、電子メールなどの情報技術の活用も織り込み、情報化や国際化への対応も見受けられる。

理論的には、クリティカル・リテラシーとの関連で、P. Freire の言語を含む教育理論をはじめ、構成主義、Vygotsky の社会・文化的アプローチなどを縦横に駆使している。

本論文は、英文で執筆されており、すでにその主要部分は、海外にも発信されて、国内外での高い評価を得ている。

最後に、広い視野からみた場合、クリティカル・リテラシーのアプローチは近年外国語としての英語やフランス語の教育では研究されているが、スペイン語教育での本格的取り組みは、本論文をもって嚆矢とするとみることできる。

以上の理由により、本論文は博士（人間科学）の学位の授与にふさわしいものと判定した。