

Title	A Newly Discovered Fragment of the Śrīkr。ṣṇakīrtan
Author(s)	Kitada, Makoto; Tamot, Kashinath
Citation	Tokyo University Linguistic Papers. 2013, 33, p. 293-300
Version Type	VoR
URL	https://hdl.handle.net/11094/57162
rights	
Note	

The University of Osaka Institutional Knowledge Archive : OUKA

https://ir.library.osaka-u.ac.jp/

The University of Osaka

A Newly Discovered Fragment of the Śrīkrsnakīrtan

Kashinath Tamot (Nepal Research Centre) Makoto Kitada (Osaka University)

Keywords: Middle Bengali, Newar, Kathmandu

Abstract

Baru Caṇḍīdās' Śrīkṛṣṇakīrtan (ŚKK), a collection of songs on Kṛṣṇa, is considered the earliest text in Middle Bengali. For a long time, only one manuscript has been available to scholars. Recently, however, a fragment which contains several songs parallel to the ŚKK was discovered in Kathmandu.

The Carvapada, a collection of Tantric Buddhist hymns written in the old forms of the Eastern NIA dialects, is considered the oldest specimen of Old Bengali by Bengali scholars, while Baru Candīdās' Śrīkrsnakīrtan¹ (abbr, ŚKK), which is the second oldest document in Bengali, represents the beginning of the linguistic stage of Middle Bengali. Also from the point of view of the history of Bengali literature, the Śrīkṛṣṇakīṛtan is a very important work, in that, being composed in the 14th century, it is a forerunner of the Bengali Vaishnava poems which have never ceased to enjoy general popularity in the Bengalispeaking areas up to modern times. In spite of being such an important document, only one manuscript has so far been available to us.

Recently, however, a possible fragment of the SKK was discovered in Kathmandu valley. The details of the discovery are as follows. When Makoto Kitada visited the Nepal Research Centre, Kathmandu, in March 2011, Kashinath Tamot told him that he had found a manuscript of songs in Bengali language, and that Caṇḍīdās was mentioned as the author. He expressed his conjecture that these songs could be from the ŚKK. In August 2012, we worked together on this manuscript. As a result of that, this manuscript in fact turned out to be a genuine fragment of the SKK, although only a very small part of it. This article was written by Kitada with the permission of Tamot, and published under both of our names.2

The information about this manuscript (abbr. MS) is: Manuscript No. 1-1696, Real No. B287/2, titled merely as 'Rāga', written in Newārī script3. It contains 13 folios, but those which concern us are the first six-and-a-half folios (Fol. 1r-7r). The rest (Fol. 7v-13v) deals with a collection of fables in Newarī based on the Pañcatantra, which has nothing to do with the former part of the manuscript.

¹ For general information on Baru Caṇḍīdās' Śrīkṛṣṇakīrtan, see Amitrasūdan Bhaṭṭācārya 2011, Bidbadballabh 2007/2008 and Das 1988.

I would like to express my cordial thanks to Prof. Rahul Peter Das for his helpful suggestions.

In Prof. Tamot's opinion, the style of letters is that of about the 16th to 17th centuries.

Folios 1r-7r consist of two parts:

- (1) Thirteen songs numbered from 14 to 27. They contain many linguistic features and expressions common to the ŚKK. At the top of each song, the name of the *rāga* and the name of the *tāla* are mentioned⁴.
- (2) Songs Nos. 28 to 34 seem to originate from the opening scene of a drama in Bengali, in which the characters appear on the stage one after another, introducing themselves to the audience in song. The name of a king, *Govindacanda* who is mentioned suggests that this drama is a version of the Gopīcandranāṭaka which used to be one of the very popular dramas performed in the Kathmandu valley. Expressions such as *bamgeśvara rājā*, *bamgero bhuvāpati* (meaning 'the king of Vanga/Bengal') etc. hint at a certain connection of this drama with Bengal. The text breaks off abruptly.

Accurate deciphering of the manuscript is difficult. Newārī script is in many cases not completely free from obscurity and ambiguity. In Classical Newārī spelling, the distinction between dental and retroflex as well as the distinction between L and R in the NIA languages is not perfectly retained and is very often confused. I have the impression that the Newārī transcriber[s] was/were not able to understand the original language (an earlier stage of Middle Bengali) any more. All these make the text extremely hard to understand. Therefore, in this short article, I will confine myself to a few brief remarks.

Song No.16 in its *bhanitā* verse mentions Baru Candidās as the author:

vāsariya raṇa śire vaṃdiyā gāyiro vadu caṇḍidāsa //16,7d "Thus sang Baru Caṇḍīdās, [holding] Goddess Bāsalī on his head [and] praising [her]."⁵

This is parallel to the *bhanitā* verse of, e.g., ŚKK 131⁶:

bāsalī śire bandī gāilo caṇḍīdāsa //ŚKK 131,4d "[Thus] sang Caṇḍīdās, [holding] Goddess Bāsalī on his head [and] praising [her]."

Song No.15 contains parallels of ŚKK 105⁷. I first give the whole text of No.15 below⁸, then Amitrasūdan Bhaṭṭācarya's version.

No.15

Rāga Pahariyā // Parimāna //

tugu .

⁴ Song No.14 (Bhatyāri, Jati), No.15 (Pahariyā, Parimāna), No.16 (Korāba, Parimāna), No.17 (Bhathali, Paritāra), No.18 (Śrī, Ekatāla), No.19 (Śrīrāga, Ekatāli), No.20 (Śrī, Ramga (?) Jati), No.21 (Rāga Varāri, Ekatāli), No.22 (Rāga Patamaṃjali, Paritāla), No.23 (Śrīrāga, Tāra Mātha Jati), No.24 (Savali, Mātha Jati), No.25 (Nāta, Rūpaka), No.26 (Nāta, Rūpaka).

⁵ The term *rana* is unclear.

 $^{^6\,}$ Bhattācārya 2011, p. 293. Bidbadballabh 2007/2008, p. 48f.

⁷ Bhaṭṭācārya 2011, p. 259f. Bidbadbhallabh 2007/2008, p. 38f.

Words are not separately written in the manuscript, but here, separations are given according to our own provisional interpretation.

```
ati padumini rūpasa desiyā
                               ceta thira nahi morā /
surati simghāra diyā rādhika
                                 prāna raksā kara more //
                                    mukhe nahi tora nāja /
nampata kahnāya kapata upāya
sudala morā nideşi bhāre
                             pariksā dekhiyā rūpasa kaje //
                                  kimsake volahu maurāni /
kāmasukha bāne ceta byākula
vola paradite akșe bhādiresa
                                camyi jāniya ahme //
                                judāyi ra [?]9 datā he
bhayata duya mora nayi jiya
ahmāra jaubhana [??]<sup>10</sup> śrī
phala khāyita kasaka dhāya //
                                      ki torā kāvaya<sup>12</sup> kāya /
jāhe khidhā vaise<sup>11</sup> suno govārinī
jakhana je pāya takhana se khāya
                                      jānahi khidhā parāya //
                                         ihate nahī kaculi /
amāra jaubhavana mudita bhamdāra
                                         khāyi re suyi<sup>13</sup> re mali //
amāra jaubhavana kāla bhujamgama
tuhme padumini ahme padmanābha
                                        kşaure tuhmāke nahi chādi /
tumāra jauvana kāla bhujamgama
                                      ame bhara ujhā gadali //15
```

The corresponding song, ŚKK 105 in Bhaṭṭācārya's edition, runs as follows:

```
Deśāgarāgah //
āti rūpasī paduminī jātī dekhi thīra nahi mane /
tora birahe citta beākula moem nā jībom kenamane //105,1
henaka bacana nā bola kāhnāñim tora bāpe nāhim lāja /
sodara māūlānīta bhole parilāhā dekhiām rūpasa kāja //2
madanabāne citta beākula kibā ghosasi māmī māmī /
michā kāje moke bhānditem cāho sakale jāņie āhmī //3
chāoyāla kāhnāñim bola na bujhasi bujhila tohmāra matī /
mom je goālinī ābālī rādhā na jāņo ranga suratī //4
āhme se kāhnāñim goāla nāgara tohmāra bāra barişe /
nahuli yaubana āti śuśobhana surati deha harișe //5
prathama yaubana mudita bhandara tata na sambae curī /
āhmāra yaubana kāla bhujangama chuilem khāilem marī //6
āhme se kāhnāñim tohme candrābalī maraņe tohmā nā chārī /
tohmāra yaubana kāla bhujangama āhmeho bhāla gārurī //7
nāgara kāhnāñim moke bigute āśeşa neāa jurī /
kona bibudhi e hena pathe ānile dāruņī burhī //8
```

⁹ An unclear letter.

¹⁰ Unclear letters.

¹¹ Or: caise?

¹² Or: kācapa?

¹³ Or: *supi*?

nāgara dekhiām deha ālingana kike kara ābhiroṣe / āhmara karame tohmāka āṇile barāyira kamaṇa doṣe //9 tapata dudha nāle nā pīe jurāyilem soāda tāe / nahulī yaubana kāmca śiriphala tāhāka keho nāhim khāe //10 yāta khidhā base nagari rādhā kibā tāra kāmca pākāe / yemane pāe temane khāe yā nāhim khidhā pālae //11 dīṭhi cāhi bolom mo kāhnāñim āhmāka eritem juāe / samukha dīṭhe parile banata bhukhila bāgha nā khāe //12 āhmāra bacane sundari rādhā mane kara hariṣe / basalīcaraṇa śire bandiām gāila baru caṇḍīdāse //13

This is a dialogue about a quarrel between Kṛṣṇa and Rādhā. For convenience, I quote the translation by Klaiman¹⁴:

- "You're so alluring, a natural seductress¹⁵. My heart quickens pace when I see you. / With your aloofness, my thoughts are untranquil. Oh, how can I go on surviving?"
- "Krishna, don't say things like this. You don't have any modesty. Where are your parents?¹⁶ / You've merely spotted a juicy affair; you're entranced by the wife of your uncle."
- "Why must you say, 'I'm your aunt, I'm your aunt'? I've been driven insane by love's goading. / Radha, you're trying to use unfair means to elude me; I know all about it."
- "You're a child, Krishna; you can't understand what I'm saying. I see your intentions. / I am just Radha, a dairymaid; I'm very small. I know nothing of passion."
- "I'm dashing Krishna, your cowherd pursuer, and you are a twelve year old lady. / This is most lovely, your blossoming youth; you should gladly bestow it upon me."
- "My blooming youth is a treasure that's sealed. There's no possible way you could rob it. / I have a poisonous snake in this youth; if you touch and are bitten, you'll perish!"
- "I am your Krishna and you're my Candrāvalī. Till I am dead I can't leave you. / You say your youth is a poisonous snake I'm an excellent venomist, Radha!"
- "There is no end to these intricate arguments! Krishna's too smart, he unnerves me. / What sort of folly induced that cruel Granny to have me approach by this pathway?"
- "Look at your lover, bestow an embrace on me. Why are you overexcited? / How is your Granny at fault? It's because of my merits that you have been brought here."
- "Milk that is hot can't be drunk through a straw; when it is cooled, it is tasty for drinking. / Breasts which are starting to bud are like marmelos; no one enjoys them unripened!"
- "When someone's hungry for something, he couldn't care less if it's ripe or it isn't. / He'll eat it as he encounters it till all his hunger is gone, clever Radha!"
- "Krishna, I'm looking you square in the eye and I'm warning you: better avoid me. / Even a tiger will not

Klaiman 1984, p. 91. I do not necessarily agree with her interpretation in every single detail, but this will suffice for the moment, for a minute examination of the ŚKK is not the purpose of this article.

¹⁵ Padminī, i.e. women with the ideal beauty as mentioned in the Kāmaśāstra.

¹⁶ Klaiman (ibid.) notes that the literal meaning is: "you have no shame from your parents".

eat a creature he meets face to face in the forest."

"Beautiful Radha, discard your misgivings. Be pleased to agree to my wishes."

It is obvious that MS song No.15 is closely connected with ŚKK 105, but, containing many variants, fails to agree with it word for word.

It must be noted that the ŚKK was originally orally recited. This fact raises the question, to what degree the written sources are reliable, while the texts orally handed down vary. It may be whether a collection of components of various origins, or the enlargement and alteration of a single kernel.

MS Song No.27 again has a *bhaṇitā* verse in which the name Caṇḍīdās (*caṇḍīdāse*) appears, and contains many lines parallel to ŚKK 291. The text runs as follows:

rādhe // tini kitana dadhi, torā hoyiveka kata nā vudhi //27,1 kahnāvī, haivo muyi govārini jāti, morā ghṛta dudha utapati //2 rādhe, o torā do rājavaisya mai uthi dayā curase //3 kahnāyi, kācaram pākerokali, mai nahi jāne <su>17rati murāri 18 //4 rādhe, kata vasāna¹⁹ se sati, pamca puruse pohāyi rāti //5 kahnāyi, uceta pamthera nāli, yibe vāmchita tuyi he murāri //6 rādhe, sargga mañca pātāre mu jāni, yibe ahmāke sati vaṣāni //7 kahnāyi, kamsāsura vada duruvāre, tehi sunire nahi ucāre //8 rādhe, kamsa vadhire ahme vāne, tave sādhivo māhādāni lo //9 kahnāyi, muyi reki putanā māri, khāyire aje tiri vadhiya murāri //10 rādhe, māyi reki jānahi māli, tathi pāpa je nahi sundari //11 kahnāyi, khāyireki tanera khīra, ive vola <vāra>20 ha vacana vīra //12 rādhe, piyara mai janani rakṣām lire, mora teja vasira śarire //13 kahnāyi, tohara mukha nahi cāhi, ati pāpeta kāla kahnāyi he //14 rādhya, ahmāke na patiśi dhamdhā, moke vudhi thāyiyo jāha vamdhā //15 kahnāyi, reho mora sāta sarihār²¹, moke vadāyi deho ekovāra //16 rādhe, deho moke surati simghāre, tave vadāvi diſśa?]²² tuhmāke //17 kahnāyi, dvādaśa variśe ahme nahi jāna, surati dhammāri he //18 rādhya, māthāya guri phure tora khoyā²³, ralakṣaka mulelo //19 kahnāyi, yitum cchāda patiyāse, kavi gīta gāyila camdidāse he //20

The corresponding verse, ŚKK 291²⁴, runs as follows:

¹⁷ This syllable is marked with a sign of deletion.

¹⁸ Or: surāri

¹⁹ I.e. bakhāna < Skt. vyākhyāna.

²⁰ Marked with a sign of deletion.

²¹ Here is a *virāma* sign.

²² Extremely obscure.

²³ Or: $khop\bar{a}$

korārāgaḥ // krīḍā // laganī // daṇḍakaḥ // rādhā nitī bikaņasi dadhī / tora haibe kata nā budhī //1 kāhnāñim hoom mo goālajātī / mora budhī tora kheūmatī //2 rādhā / māthata gulāla phule / tora nahe se lākheka mūle²⁵ //3 bolasi tom tutībacane / tāta nā lāge āhmāra mane //4 hoām tom goālajhiārī / tohme eta bara āchidarī //5 nahom kāhna mo āchidarī / bara nilaja tohme murārī //6 rādhā tora thīra nahe maņe toke manda bolom tekāraņe //7 kansa bara durubāre / tāra bhae nibārom tohmāre26 //8 kansa māribom parāņe / tabe sādhibom āpaņa māņe²⁷ //9 kālī khāilem tohme khīre / āji bolasi bāmana bīre²⁸ //10 khāām pūtanāra khīre / tāra parāna harilom sarīre //11 vadhilem pūtanā nārī / tohme tirībadhiā murārī²⁹ //12 mārantāka ye nā māre / tāra pāṇī nā lae pītare //13 tora mukha nāhim cāhī / tohme āti pāpiā kāhnāñim 30 //14 juriām e pāmca bāņe / āji laïbom tora parāņe //15 tohme nā kara mora nirāse / gāila baru caņdīdāse //16

I quote Klaiman's translation³¹:

[&]quot;Most of time you spend selling your produce. / How much intelligence you must have Radha!"

[&]quot;Krishna, although I was born among cowherds, / I have my sense, while you're addle-minded!"

[&]quot;One hundred thousand's the worth of your head with its blossoms of basil. / You haven't the money!"

[&]quot;You may address me with flattering comments; Still I'm not taken in by them, Krishna."

[&]quot;You're completely intractable, Radha, / Even though you're a dairyman's daughter."

[&]quot;I'm not the one who's intractable. Krishna. / You're extremely audacious, Murāri."

[&]quot;You're impulsive in temperament, Radha; / This is the reason I call you unworthy."

[&]quot;Kamsa is very implacable, Krishna. / Since I'm afraid of him, I must resist you."

[&]quot;I am about to assassinate Kamsa; / Then I'll be able to salvage my honour."

[&]quot;Only a day ago, milk was your diet. / Now you proclaim you're a hero, you midget!"

[&]quot;While I imbibed Lady Pūtanā's milk, I / Extracted the life from her body, my Radha."

[&]quot;Did you destroy Lady Pūtanā, Krishna? / Why, you have murdered a woman, Murāri!"

[&]quot;Forefathers don't accept votive oblations / From those who avoid killing murderous people."

²⁴ Bhatṭācārya 2011, p. 367f. Bidbadballabh 2007/2008, p. 108f.

²⁵ Corresponding to MS 27,19: *rādhya*, *māthāya guri phure tora khoyā ralakṣaka mulelo*.

²⁶ Cf. MS 27,8, although its second half is different.

²⁷ Corresponding to MS 27.9: rādhe, kamsa vadhire ahme vāne, tave sādhivo māhādāni lo.

²⁸ Corresponding to MS 27,12: kahnāyi, khāyireki tanera khīra, ive vola <vāra>ha vacana vīra.

²⁹ Corresponding to MS 27,10: kahnāyi, muyi reki putanā māri, khāyire aje tiri vadhiya murāri.

³⁰ Corresponding to MS 27,14: kahnāyi, tohara mukha nahi cāhi, ati pāpeta kāla kahnāyi he.

³¹ Klaiman 1984, p.223f.

"I cannot look at your face any longer. / You are extremely unprincipled, Krishna."

"This very day, I'll discharge these five arrows / and snatch you away from the world of existence!"

"Don't take way my serenity, Krishna!"

These are all the portions that have been elucidated so far. Although the language shows many linguistic features common to the ŚKK, many lines remain unclear because of the above mentioned difficulties. Nevertheless, many parallel expressions and lines are found, which suggest that these songs are from the ŚKK.

Song No.18, although not identified in the ŚKK, is one whose meaning is relatively clear:

Śrī // ekatāli //

antare antare gopi antare aṃganā / rāsa mandara kṣere devakinandane //dhru kāhu deya āriṃgana kāhu deya cuṃbane / stane nakha ghāta deya adhara daṃsane //dhru nivi visarccana kare kṛṣṇa rasa vase gagane apasaragana sayatnikhase // rāti bādhe kṛṣṇa rame candra kāma dhandhā //18

The gist would be:

"Inside, inside, cowgirls, [come] inside the court! / In the circle of the dance party $(r\bar{a}sa)$ plays $(k\bar{s}ere = khele)$ the son of Devakī (= Kṛṣṇa). He gives someone an embrace, gives someone a kiss, / [and] gives [someone] a scratch of nail in the breast, and [someone] a bite in the lips. // In the excess of desire (rasa-vase), he unties someone's waist string. / In the sky, apsaras [???]. // Seeing the play $(krd\bar{a} = kr\bar{\iota}d\bar{a})$ in the circle of the dance party, the moon is motionless, / Kṛṣṇa enjoys the night [???]. //"

As for MS Song Nos. 28 to 34, i.e. the second subdivision dealing with a drama scene, a question remains about what relation this drama has with the preceding Kṛṣṇa songs. Does it indicate that the Kṛṣṇa songs were sung before the drama began on the stage? Or, were the two texts without any connection put together in one manuscript? As pointed out in the beginning of this article, expressions like "the king of Bengal/Vaṅga" shows that this drama has a certain connection with Bengal. At the moment we are not able to give an adequate answer to this question without comparing this fragment with other manuscripts of the Gopīcandranāṭaka preserved in the Kathmandu Valley. Whatever it may be, we will continue further investigations into this matter and our results will be published in the future.

Abbreviations

MS = manuscript NIA = New Indo Aryan $\acute{S}KK = \acute{S}rik rsnakirtan$

References

Bhaṭṭācātya, Amitrasūdan (2011), *Baru Caṇḍīdāser Śrīkṛṣṇakīrtan Samagra*. Trayodaś saŋskaraṇ 2011AD, pratham saŋskaraṇ 1966AD. Kalˈkātā: De'j Pābˈliśiŋ.

Bidbadballabh, Basantarañjan Rāy (2007/2008), Śrīkṛṣṇakūrtan. Ekādaś sanskaran 1414

(= 2007/2008AD), pratham sanskaran 1323 (= 1916/1917AD).

Kal'kātā: Bangīya-Sāhitya-Pariṣat.

Das, Rahul Peter (1988), "On the English Translation of the Śrīkṛṣṇakīrtana", Zeitschrift der Deutschen Morgenländischen Gesellschaft 138.1988, 332-348.

Klaiman, M.H. (1984), Baru Caṇḍādasa. Singing the glory of Lord Krishna. The Śrkṛṣṇakīrtana translated and annotated by M.H. Klaiman. Chico, California Scholars Press. American Academy of religion, Classics in Religious Studies, Number 5.

Acknowledgement

This research is subsidized by Japan Society for the Promotion of Science, Grants-in-aid No. 21720019.

『クリシュナ讃歌』の新発見の写本断片

カーシーナート・タモート 北田 信

キーワード: 中期ベンガル語、ネワール、カトマンドゥ

ボル・チョンディダシュ (Baru Caṇḍīdās) 作『クリシュナ讃歌』(Śrīkṛṣṇakīrtan) は中期ベンガル語最初の作品である。今まで、写本はベンガル地方で一個しか見つかっていなかった。ところが最近になって、ネパール・カトマンドゥでこの作品の写本断片が発見された。本論文では、この写本断片を簡潔に記述し、そこに記載された歌詞のうち、二つを『クリシュナ讃歌』のものと同定した。